**Evaluating Claims and Reasoning**

***“Why College Isn’t for Everyone”   
and “Actually, College Is Very Much Worth It”***

Compare the claims made by each of these two writers. Evaluate the reasons and evidence used by each writer. What is relevant and convincing?

For each text, write the claim and its supporting evidence in the following chart.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| “Why College Isn’t for Everyone” | “Actually, College Is Very Much Worth It” |
| Claim: | **Claim:** |
| Evidence:  1.  2.  3.  4. | **Evidence:**  **1.**  **2.**  **3.**  **4.**  **5.** |
| Counterclaims: | **Counterclaims:**  **1.**  **2.**  **Where located?** |
| Evidence / Refutations:  1.  2.  3. | **Evidence / Refutations:**  **1.**  **2.**  **3.**  **4.** |

1. Which writer presents the more convincing argument? Why? Cite evidence to support your conclusion.
2. What elements, if any, do you think are missing from either of these pieces? Explain.
3. Why do you think Andrew J. Rotherham (in “Actually, College Is Very Much Worth It”) disclosed at the end of his article that he is a member of an educational group? How does this disclosure affect your perception of his argument?

An argument contains a conclusion that often restates the primary claim and tries to convince the reader to take an action.

1. What is the call to action in “Why College Isn’t for Everyone”?
2. What is the call to action in “Actually, College Is Very Much Worth It”?